



# A comparative study of the mental health and wellbeing of different professional student populations

Elisa Lewis

Supervisors:

Dr Jackie Cardwell, RVC

Professor Jonathan Smith, Birkbeck

# Background

Poor mental health and an elevated suicide risk identified amongst medical occupational groups

Professionals widely studied, scant research with UK professional students and few comparative studies

The present research aims

# Proposed explanations for heightened psychological distress

- Self-selection and recruitment of students susceptible to mental health problems
- Vulnerable personality traits
- Negative effects and stressors of training
- Mental health stigma
- Fears of impact upon career



# Veterinary Student Mental Health: RVC Study

## ***A cross-sectional study of mental health in veterinary undergraduate students***

Cardwell, J.M., Lewis, E.G., Bailie, S.B., Holt, E.R., Allister, R., Mellanby, R. & Adams, V.J.

- Aimed to quantify: mental health and attitudes towards mental health and suicide
- Participants: All five years of the RVC Bachelor of Veterinary Medicine Course. Response rate: 48% (509/1086)

### **Key Findings:**

- Wellbeing amongst veterinary students significantly poorer compared with the general population,  $p < 0.001$  (NatCen, 2010)
- Significantly higher levels of mental distress amongst students than the UK general population,  $p < 0.0001$  (NatCen, 2010)
- 54% has experienced a mental health problem
- 25% had engaged in suicide ideation

# How do RVC Students Compare with Other Veterinary Medicine Students?

International studies also reveal high levels of distress:

- 37% of veterinary students felt “so depressed it was difficult to function” (Kogan et al. 2005)
- 32% experienced clinical levels of depressive symptoms (Hafen et al. 2006)
- 2/3 felt overwhelmed the heavy workload (Collins & Foote, 2005)
- 87% of Australian veterinary students “rarely or never sought professional counselling” (Williams et al. 2005)

# Factors associated with distress and help seeking in veterinary students

## ***Mental distress:***

- Difficulty fitting in with peers
- Interpersonal problems
- Work overload
- Academic concerns

(Hafen et al. 2006, 2008; McLennan & Sutton, 2005)

## ***Help seeking:***

- Stigma: perceptions of “not handling things well” or “not strong”  
(Kogan & McConnell, 2001)
- Competitive atmosphere and fear of admission error  
(Collins & Foote, 2005)

# Do veterinary students differ from other student groups?

We don't know. Very few direct comparisons with other professional groups.

Single population studies show heightened psychological morbidity among healthcare students.

# Key Findings from the Literature

## **Medical Students:**

- Prevalence



# Key Findings from the Literature

## Medical Students:

- <25% of depressed medical students sought help (Givens & Tjia, 2002)
- “Tell no one but encourage him/her to seek professional help” most common response by medical students to hypothetical illness in a colleague (Roberts et al. 2005)
- Stigma related to help-seeking in students at Manchester University Medical School:

(Chew-Graham et al. 2003)

- Medical students, who had previously sought counselling, less likely to be invited to interview for residencies (Oppenheimer & Miller, 1988)

# Key Findings from the Literature

## Dental students:

- Psychological distress rose from 36% in the first year to 44% in the fifth year (Gorter et al. 2008)
- Emotional exhaustion – 39%,  
Depersonalisation – 20% (Gorter et al. 2008)
- Low levels of social support associated with depression (Laurence et al. 2009)

# Key Findings from the Literature

## Pharmacy students:

- High levels of stress negatively correlated with health-related quality of life and self-esteem (Marshall et al. 2008, Mimura et al. 2008)
- Mental wellbeing significantly poorer than age-adjusted US population norms (Hirsch et al. 2009)

# Key Findings from the Literature

## Multi-cohort studies

- Prevalence of psychological stress in fifth year: dental students 72% v medical students 32% (Newbury-Birch et al. 1998)
- High levels of perfectionism among medical, dental and pharmacy students. Pharmacy students highest on socially prescribed perfectionism (Henning et al. 1998)
- 50.1% of pharmacy students clinically distressed, higher prevalence than both dental and medical students (Henning et al. 1998)

# Selecting the populations

Healthcare profession students subject to similar stressors

- Veterinary Medicine
- Medicine
- Dentistry
- Pharmacy

Suggested contributing factors to psychological distress:

- Competitive and high achieving environment
- Perfectionism
- Dissonance between expectation and reality
- Social and people skills
- Reluctance to seek help
- And Law students...

# Key Findings from the Literature

## Law students:

(Dammeyer & Nunez, 1999)

- Law students higher significantly higher rates of psychiatric distress than medical students and the general population (Shanfield & Benjamin, 1985)
- Before law school mental health similar to general population, significant increases in distress post entry (Shanfield & Benjamin, 1986)
- Increase in depression from 21% pre-law school to 50% at the end of the first year (Reifman et al. 2000)

# Questionnaire Design

Extension of questionnaire used in research with RVC students

Scale	Measuring
Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well	



# Populations and responses...so far

Veterinary students: 595

Medical students: 141



# Preliminary Findings: Wellbeing

Feelings and thoughts over previous two weeks assessed using **Warwick Edinburgh Mental Wellbeing Scale**

0 = least positive; 70 = most positive

No significant difference between the populations





# Preliminary Findings: Depression

The **Beck Depression Inventory** was used to detect depression and assess its severity

0 = non-depressed; 63 = severely depressed

Level of depression differed significantly between degree courses ( $p = 0.006$ )

School 5 had higher scores on the BDI, denoting greater severity of depression, than School 1,  $p = 0.003$



# Preliminary Findings: Experience of Specific Issues

“Are you currently experiencing any of the problems listed below?”

	School 1	School 2	School 3	School 4	School 5
Anxiety disorder / panic attack	<b>17.4%</b> (92/530)	<b>16.4%</b> (19/116)	<b>10.5%</b> (8/76)	<b>18.3%</b> (20/109)	<b>17.6%</b> (22/125)
Depression	<b>19.8%</b> (105/530)	<b>19.8%</b> (23/116)	<b>7.9%</b> (6/76)	<b>17.4%</b> (19/109)	<b>24.0%</b> (30/125)
Eating disorder	<b>5.8%</b> (31/530)	<b>4.3%</b> (5/116)	<b>6.6%</b> (5/76)	<b>9.2%</b> (10/109)	<b>11.2%</b> (14/125)
Low self-esteem	<b>36.4%</b> (193/530)	<b>28.4%</b> (33/116)	<b>28.9%</b> (22/76)	<b>36.7%</b> (40/109)	<b>39.2%</b> (49/125)
Obsessive compulsive disorder (p < 0.05)	<b>7.9%</b> (42/530)	<b>4.3%</b> (5/116)	<b>5.3%</b> (4/76)	<b>10.1%</b> (11/109)	<b>15.20%</b> (19/125)
Self-harm (p < 0.05)	<b>3.0%</b> (16/530)	<b>6.0%</b> (7/116)	<b>1.3%</b> (1/76)	<b>0.9%</b> (1/109)	<b>8.0%</b> (10/125)

# Preliminary Findings: Suicide Ideation

“Have you ever thought about taking your life, even if you would not really do it?”

	School 1	School 2	School 3	School 4	School 5
Yes – most recently in the last 12 months	<b>20.2%</b> (107/530)	<b>31.9%</b> (37/116)	<b>11.8%</b> (9/76)	<b>11.0%</b> (12/109)	<b>26.4%</b> (33/125)
Yes – most recently more than 12 months ago	<b>18.5%</b> (98/530)	<b>17.2%</b> (20/116)	<b>15.8%</b> (12/76)	<b>22.0%</b> (24/109)	<b>16.0%</b> (20/125)
Overall:	<b>38.7%</b> (205/530)	<b>49.1%</b> (57/116)	<b>27.6%</b> (21/76)	<b>33.0%</b> (36/109)	<b>42.4%</b> (53/125)



# Preliminary findings: Suicide Attempts

“Have you ever made an attempt to take your life, by taking an overdose of tablets or in some other way?”

	School 1	School 2	School 3	School 4	School 5
Yes – most recently in the last 12 months	<b>0.9%</b> (5/530)	<b>2.6%</b> (3/116)	<b>0%</b> (0/76)	<b>1.8%</b>	





# Preliminary findings: Attitudes to Suicide

“Suicide is never justified no matter how bad things are”

Strongly Agree / Agree				
School 1	School 2	School 3	School 4	School 5
<b>41.8%</b> (240/574)	<b>23.9%</b> (32/134)	<b>57.8%</b> (52/90)	<b>67.4%</b> (91/135)	<b>43.2%</b> (64/148)

p < 0.001

“People with incurable diseases should be allowed to commit suicide in a dignified manner”

Strongly Agree / Agree				
School 1	School 2	School 3	School 4	School 5
<b>74.7%</b> (429/574)	<b>48.5%</b> (65/134)	<b>54.4%</b> (49/90)	<b>32.6%</b> (44/135)	<b>67.6%</b> (100/148)

p < 0.001





# A Mixed Methods Approach

## Qualitative Phase

- Questionnaire: what has it not told us?
- Semi-structured interviews
- Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA)
  - idiographic
  - privileges the individual's account
  - phenomenological
  - allows students to express what is important to *them*





# References

Cardwell

# References

- Kogan, L. R., McConnell, S. L., & Schoenfeld-Tacher, R. (2005). Veterinary Students and Non-academic Stressors. *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 32(2), 193-200.
- Laurence, B., Williams, C., & Eiland, D. (2009). Depressive Symptoms, Stress and Social Support Among Dental Students at a Historically Black College and University. *Journal of American College Health*, 58(1), 56-63.
- Marshall, L. L., Allison, A., Nykamp, D., & Lanke, S. (2008). Perceived stress and quality of life among doctor of pharmacy students. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 72(6), 1-8.
- McLennan, M. W., & Sutton, R. H. (2005). Stress in Veterinary Science Students: A Study at the University of Queensland. *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 32(2), 213-218.
- Mimura, C., Murrells, T., & Griffiths, P. (2008). The association between stress, self-esteem and childhood acceptance in nursing and pharmacy students: a comparative cross-cultural analysis. *Stress and Health*, 25, 209-220.
- Moffat, K. J., McConnachie, A., Ross, S., & Morrison, J. M. (2004). First year medical student stress and coping in a problem-based learning medical curriculum. *Medical Education*, 38, 482-491.
- NATCEN. (2010). NatCen Social Research and Royal Free and University College Medical School. Department of Epidemiology and Public Health. *Health Survey for England, 2010*.
- Newbury-Birch, D., Lowry, R. J., & Kamali, F. (2002). The changing patterns of drinking, illicit drug use, stress, anxiety and depression in dental students in a UK dental school: a longitudinal study. *British Dental Journal*, 192(11), 646-649.
- Nicholson, S., Jenkins, R., & Meltzer, H. (2009). Suicidal thoughts, suicide attempts and self-harm. In S. McManus, H. Meltzer, T. Brugha, P. Bebbington & R. Jenkins (Eds.), *Adult Psychiatric Morbidity in England, 2007: Results of a Household Survey* (pp. 71 - 81): The NHS Information Centre for health and social care.
- Oppenheimer, K. C., & Miller, M. D. (1988). Stereotypic Views of Medical Educators Toward Students with a History of Psychological Counseling. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 35(3), 311-314.
- Reifman, A., McIntosh, D. N., & Ellsworth, P. C. (2000). Depression and Affect Among Law Students During Law School: A Longitudinal Study. *Journal of Emotional Abuse*, 2(1), 93-106.
- Roberts, L. W., Warner, T. D., Rogers, M., Horwitz, R., & Redgrave, G. (2005). Medical student illness and impairment: a vignette-based survey study involving 955 students at 9 medical schools. *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 46, 229-237.
- Shanfield, S. B., & Benjamin, G. A. H. (1985). Psychiatric Distress in Law Students. *Journal of Legal Education*, 65, 65-73.
- Tyssen, R., Vaglum, P., Gronvold, N. T., & Ekeberg, O. (2001). Suicidal ideation among medical students and young physicians: a nationwide and prospective study of prevalence and predictors. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 64, 69-79.
- Williams, S. M., Arnold, P. K., & Mills, J. N. (2005). Coping with stress: A survey of Murdoch University Veterinary Students. *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 32(2), 201-212.
- Zoccolillo, M., Murphy, G. E., & Wetzel, R. D. (1986). Depression among Medical Students. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 11, 91-96.



[elewis@rvc.ac.uk](mailto:elewis@rvc.ac.uk)